

Toxic Mutation of an Ancient Hatred: Left-Wing Antisemitism

PETER KURTI

Acknowledgement

This *Policy Paper* began life as a paper I presented on a panel about antisemitism at the Centre for Independent Studies' Consilium conference held in September 2019. Joining me on the panel there were Máté Hajba, Daniel Pipes, and Julian Leeser MP. My conversations with them helped clarify my thinking on key points and I am grateful for their contributions.

I am also grateful to Henry Ergas, Tzvi Fleischer, Simon Cowan, and Jeremy Sammut who read an earlier draft of this Policy Paper. They corrected a number of factual errors and made very helpful comments about the structure of the argument. Karla Pincott edited the manuscript and designed the cover, and Ryan Acosta laid out the text for publication. Needless to say, the responsibility for any errors or omissions is entirely mine.

Peter Kurti
14 November 2019



A catalogue record for this book is available from the National Library of Australia

Toxic Mutation of an Ancient Hatred: Left-Wing Antisemitism

Peter Kurti



POLICY Paper 25

Contents

Introduction: Antisemitism – An Ancient Hatred.....	1
New Forms of the Ancient Hatred.....	2
The Postmodern Left’s Convergence of Anti-Zionism and Antisemitism	2
United Nations Resolution 3379: Zionism = Racism	3
Antisemitism and International Human Rights: Boycott, Divestment and Sanctions.....	4
Postmodern Left Antisemitism in Australia	5
Jeremy Corbyn and the Antisemitism of the British Postmodern Left	5
The Squad: Postmodern Left Antisemitism in the United States.....	7
Is there a problem of postmodern left antisemitism in Australia?.....	7
Endnotes	9



Introduction: Antisemitism – An Ancient Hatred

Antisemitism — the hatred of Jews — has long been a part of human history, and has appeared in different forms, with different motivations and varying intensities. Many factors are proposed as explanations for antisemitism, which long predates Christianity¹ — although historically Christianity has also contributed to it.

The demonology about Jews became – and remains – deeply entrenched in Western culture; and provokes an eliminationist response that is an integral component of antisemitism.² As Jonathan Sacks has noted:

Antisemitism exists and is dangerous whenever two contradictory factors appear in combination: the belief that Jews are so powerful that they are responsible for the evils of the world, and the knowledge that they are so powerless that they can be attacked with impunity.³

Working definition and spelling of antisemitism

In 2016 the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance (IHRA), a large, multinational intergovernmental body, adopted a “Working Definition of Antisemitism that has now become the most widely accepted definition. It is the definition used in this Policy Paper:

Antisemitism is a certain perception of Jews, which may be expressed as hatred toward Jews. Rhetorical and physical manifestations of antisemitism are directed toward Jewish or non-Jewish individuals and/or their property, toward Jewish community institutions and religious facilities.⁴

While there are different points of view about the correct spelling, this paper will adopt the spelling advocated by IHRA: *antisemitism*. However, where an author who uses a different form is quoted, that spelling will be retained.

New Forms of the Ancient Hatred

After World War II and the Holocaust, antisemitism seemed unthinkable and any public expression of it was certainly unacceptable. However, this does not preclude that it continued to fester in private. And there is now clear and increasing evidence that *public* expressions of antisemitism are on the rise again in many parts of the Western world.

Writing in the *Philadelphia Inquirer* in August 2019, columnist Marc Thiessen cited a recent CNN poll that found: “more than a quarter of Europeans say Jews have too much influence in business and finance, while one in five said Jews have too much influence in the media and politics.”⁵ In a survey of Israeli Jews conducted in 2016, the Pew Research Center found 64% thought antisemitism is very common around the world; and 76% thought antisemitism is not only common but is increasing.⁶

In global terms, antisemitism has spread with the greatest intensity in Arab and Islamic countries during the post-war era. The founding of the State of Israel in 1948 contributed to this intensification but it also coincided with the rise of Arab nationalism and the emergence of anti-colonialist sentiment in Europe. However, it is important to note at the outset that antisemitism is not a consequence of the existence of Israel or of its actions.

As Daniel Jonah Goldhagen has observed, antisemitism’s tropes are age-old and precede Israel’s founding, its conflict with the Palestinians, and its dealings with its Arab neighbours.⁷ Nor does the existence of antisemitism depend upon the actions of Jews, whether individually or collectively.⁸

Whereas public manifestation of antisemitism in Arab and Islamic countries has intensified since 1945, it was accompanied by a decline in western European countries where the open expression of race-based prejudice became — and remains — unacceptable. However, over the past 40 or 50 years, a distinctive form of non-racial antisemitism has emerged as a

potent force on the political left — what is frequently called the ‘postmodern left’. This evolution has been charted by scholars such as Robert Wistrich:

Classical anti-Semitism, it should be remembered, proclaimed the Jews as a minority group to be an existential menace to a given nation—a danger to its internal homogeneity, unity, religious values, and racial purity. Postwar anti-Zionism, on the other hand, sees the nation of Israel above all as a deadly threat to world peace and the international order.⁹

This increase in left-wing antisemitism was noted in a recent report published by the United Nations Special Rapporteur on freedom of religion and belief, Ahmed Shaheed, which looked specifically at the issue of antisemitism¹⁰ and noted:

Numerous reports of an increase in many countries of “left-wing” antisemitism, in which individuals claiming to hold anti-racist and anti-imperialist views employ antisemitic narratives or tropes in the course of expressing anger at policies or practices of the Government of Israel. [The Rapporteur] emphasizes that it is never acceptable to render Jews as proxies for the Government of Israel.¹¹

Left-wing antisemitism has deep roots in 19th century political thought, but its 20th century manifestation is closely linked to the combined forces of identity politics, anti-colonialism, and anti-imperialism unleashed in the 1960s and 1970s. These forces tend to fuse in the form of anti-Zionism — hostility to the state of Israel — which is a signal feature of postmodern left antisemitism. Analysis of the apparent paradox of the emergence of antisemitism on the political left, therefore, yields a good understanding of how the facets of this ancient hatred have evolved and now appear in a modern guise.

The Postmodern Left’s Convergence of Anti-Zionism and Antisemitism

The view that the State of Israel should not exist — the basic form of anti-Zionism — has come to form a cornerstone of postmodern left antisemitism. In its more extreme expressions, anti-Zionism denies both the very concept of Jewish peoplehood entitled to self-determination, and the right of a lawfully constituted state to safeguard the security of its borders and

its people. “Anti-Zionism demonizes, dehumanizes, and delegitimizes Israel in order to bring about its destruction,” says British commentator Melanie Phillips.¹²

Support for the creation of the State of Israel was widespread on the political left during the 1947-

48 Arab-Israeli war. However, the 1967 Six-Day War marked a specific turning point in international perceptions of Israel. After 1967, the opposition to Israel which came from the left was directed at its occupation of territory, especially the West Bank, its military strength, and its perceived status as a hegemonic regional power closely allied with the United States of America.¹³

Soviet criticism of Israel, in turn, fed a fervent communist anti-Zionism that promoted defamatory theories of 'a global conspiracy funded by Jewish money' committed to 'wreaking political and economic havoc in western countries'.¹⁴

When the postmodern left emerged in the 1950s and 1960s, its worldview absorbed much of this Soviet propaganda, with a key tenet remaining a commitment to anti-Zionism — the view that the State of Israel is illegitimate and should not exist. Added to the anti-Zionist denial of Israel's claim to an ancestral homeland was "a contradictory claim that the Jews sought to maintain a 'racial state' in Israel."¹⁵

In historical terms, anti-Zionism has been quite distinct from antisemitism. Whereas the racist prejudice of antisemitism was largely a phenomenon of the political right, anti-Zionism was based on what

Australian scholar Philip Mendes has described as "a relatively objective assessment of the prospects for success for some Jews in Israel/Palestine."¹⁶ In recent decades, however, as anti-Zionism has developed into a rejection of the legitimacy of the State of Israel, anti-Zionism and antisemitism have converged.

The postmodern left's anti-Zionism was certainly influenced by Soviet hostility to Israel. However, it is a phenomenon which owes even more to the determination among the post-World War II generation to oppose racism and colonialism. Israel, according to the postmodern left, is an illegitimate remnant of western colonialism in the Middle East — a view increasingly endorsed by the United Nations as it added newly decolonised states to its membership.

Postmodern left anti-Zionists invariably insist their target is neither Jews nor individual Israeli citizens going about their ordinary lives. Rather, their target is the State of Israel itself, which they hold to be a political regime promulgating illegal, coercive, and dehumanizing treatment of Palestinians. It is a line of argument that attempts to defend the distinction between anti-Jewish remarks and criticism of Israeli government policy.

United Nations Resolution 3379: Zionism = Racism

The value of the proposition that Jews sought to secure the racialised status of Israel intensified in 1975 when the UN General Assembly passed a resolution declaring Zionism to be "a form of racism and racial discrimination."¹⁷ Although rescinded in 1991, the legacy of the original resolution retains its potency. It remains widely accepted on the left that Zionism — the movement that created Israel — commits the most heinous of the post-colonial world's moral crimes: racism.¹⁸

Postmodern left antisemitism, being interwoven with a deep-seated hostility to the USA and its allies, sees Israel as a settler, colonial venture that is part of a western drive to dominate the Middle East region. British scholar Dave Rich analyses this worldview as: "Zionism is part of a global nexus of power that is white, Western, and wealthy, and Diaspora Jews who support Israel are themselves part of this racist structure."

It is not a big step from the idea that Zionism is racism to the idea that Israel as a country should not exist at all. But it is a step many on the political left in the west have taken. And they use the word 'Zionist' as an epithet to denigrate those who defend Israel. As Rich notes: "this has become a moral question

and one of political identity, rather than an objective analysis of Israeli policy."¹⁹

What is distinctive about this new mutation of antisemitism is that its object is the State of Israel itself rather than individual Jewish people, communities or groups. However, it extends to any Jews who demur from the view that Israel is "a diabolical imperialist conspiracy that must be destroyed."²⁰ Needless to say, this is the vast majority of modern Jews.

Different forms of antisemitism as expressed on the political right, the political left, or in Islamic societies do, of course, overlap. What makes left-wing antisemitism distinctive is its different emphases.

Left-wing antisemitism tends to be expressed in terms of moral imperatives. Its focus is on the alleged capitalist financial depredations by Jews, opposing what it perceives as the supremacist claims of Zionism and the questionable legitimacy of Jewish national consciousness. Furthermore, it allies with — and adopts the language of — international human rights groups and NGOs, in criticising Israel's 'neo-colonial ambitions' and campaigning for liberation of the 'long-oppressed' Palestinian people.²¹

Antisemitism and International Human Rights: Boycott, Divestment and Sanctions

The association with such human rights groups has given the political left's opposition to Israel a global reach. As Goldhagen remarked: "the left's antisemitism has merged its long-standing identification of Jews with the predations of capitalism and the world economic order with its newfound relentless international orientation."²²

The ancient tropes of racial 'Jew hatred' antisemitism are not features of left-wing antisemitism — which is much more overtly political and secular. Human rights advocates assert they are simply upholding fundamental humanitarian principles in their pursuit of international justice and peace. They insist their hostility is not directed to Jewish people, but to alleged financial depredations and neo-colonial practices preventing the vulnerable from realising their goals.²³

Yet as English writer Ben Cohen has noted, the political left's fashionable application of the language of human rights and international justice to criticise actions by the State of Israel amounts to a questioning of the legitimacy of Israel. This questioning, in turn, is characterised by startling inconsistency as standards of extraordinary severity are applied to Israel alone:

Israel is not condemned for what it does, but for what it is. Syria and Sudan might be criticized for their woeful human rights records, but it is never suggested that either state is illegitimate in itself. Neither state is regarded, in contrast to Israel, as an inherent pariah. Neither state, therefore, is the subject of relentless campaigns questioning their right to exist; nor are they the targets of economic, academic and other boycotts.²⁴

As a consequence, "the opposition to Israel's very legitimacy means that the terms 'Jew', 'Israel', and 'Zionist' are increasingly interchangeable in contemporary left-wing discourse."²⁵

In other words, the language of humanitarian concern for rights and justice provides a respectable veil that camouflages antisemitism. It is a discourse that has given antisemitism "a universal language and justification — that is in tune with the times — for [antisemitic] beliefs and hatreds, albeit transformed and concealed to gain universal appeal."²⁶

Participants in this discourse within Australia include some trade unions, academics, journalists, political activists, and the Christian churches.

A good example of activism by the Christian churches happened at 2010's triennial Forum of the National Council of Churches in Australia (NCCA), which announced it would "continue to add its voice to the call for an end to Israel's occupation of Palestine."²⁷

Declaring its solidarity with Palestinian Christians, the NCCA went on to invite the member churches "to consider a boycott of goods produced by Israeli settlements in the Occupied Palestinian Territories," adding: "It is hoped that such actions will liberate the people [sic] from an experience of injustice to one where a just and definitive peace may be reached."²⁸

The 'call' to which the NCCA referred was the ongoing international Boycott, Divestment and Sanctions (BDS) campaign launched in 2005 by 171 Palestinian NGOs in a bid "to pressure Israel to comply with international law."²⁹

The BDS has three objectives: an end to Israel's occupation and colonization of Arab lands and removal of the Separation Wall; equal rights for Arab-Palestinian citizens inside Israel; and the right of return of Palestinian refugees.³⁰ Taken together, these are an attack on the legitimacy of the State of Israel.

The boycott campaign view of the situation in Israel makes no mention of Arab aggression against Israel in 1948 or 1967; the Palestinian rejection in 2000-01 of the Clinton-Barak offer of a Palestinian state in the West Bank and Gaza, including the removal of Jewish settlements (often cited as a barrier to peace); the more generous offer of statehood (which included an offer to withdraw from 93 per cent of the West Bank) made by Prime Minister Ehud Olmert in 2008; or of the enduring commitment of Hamas to the destruction of the State of Israel.

Notwithstanding the claim that "the focus of BDS is on Israel's abuse of power and Israeli institutions that acquiesce in that power, not on Jewish people or Judaism,"³¹ a closer examination of each of the campaign objectives shows that the BDS is not presenting a nuanced critique of Israeli government policy at all. The campaign has a darker purpose: to damage and delegitimise the Jewish state by calling into question the basis of its creation and continued existence as a liberal democracy.

The discourse of delegitimation is antisemitic. If one participates in this discourse and shares the objectives of those who propound the discourse, it is not open to claim to be untainted by their ideological position. By allying oneself with a position or an argument that is antisemitic, one becomes a participant in antisemitic discourse. To argue otherwise is disingenuous.

Postmodern Left Antisemitism in Australia

Each year, the Executive Council of Australian Jewry produces a report assessing the state of antisemitism in this country. Its 2010 report observed: "Australia does not have a past to which anti-Semites can comfortably look with nostalgia, which distinguishes it from many other countries."³²

Nonetheless, the 2010 report noted that an emerging tolerance of antisemitism in Australia "has been exacerbated with the growing phenomenon of anti-Semitism purporting to be representative of a left-wing or 'anti-racist' opinion." It is a phenomenon that report author Jeremy Jones says is extremely difficult to measure.³³ The 2018 report presented a bleaker picture, recording 366 antisemitic incidents — an increase of 59% over the previous 12-month period:

Many of the principal themes in these expressions of antisemitism, especially online, involve a cross-fertilisation of concepts between the political Left and Right. For example, left-wing rhetoric exaggerating the power of a so-called "Jewish lobby" has helped to revive and stoke far-right myths about a world Jewish conspiracy or of Jews controlling the media, economy, government or other societal institutions.³⁴

The 2019 federal election was marred by a number of ugly antisemitic incidents. The campaign conflates of three Jewish candidates, Julian Leeser, Jason Falinski, and Josh Frydenberg — all of whom were sitting Liberal MPs — were defaced with dollar signs, devil's horns, and Hitler moustaches. Antisemitic emails also were directed at another Jewish candidate, Kerryn Phelps; and posters displayed by Dave Sharma, a non-Jewish candidate campaigning in an electorate with a large number of Jewish voters, were also defaced.³⁵

Julian Leeser called it: "singularly the dirtiest and nastiest election I can remember. It really left a disgusting feeling. It's so un-Australian."³⁶

Such blatant eruption of antisemitism in Australia took many by surprise and was widely condemned. Although the antisemitic graffiti bore many of the tropes of right-wing antisemitism, it is clear that antisemitic views are now also being expressed more frequently on the political left in Australia.

Jeremy Corbyn and the Antisemitism of the British Postmodern Left

Perhaps the most prominent contemporary example of left-wing antisemitism is provided by the British Labour Party. The latent — and blatant — antisemitism that has seeped through its ranks into the public domain over the past few years has been one of the most divisive issues to confront Labour. Responsibility for this crisis can be set at the feet of the party's extreme left-wing leader (since 2015), Jeremy Corbyn.

Until then, Corbyn had been a fringe member of the party, devoting much of his time to attending protests and speaking at rallies denouncing the USA, NATO, Israel, and even his own country. He has been a noted apologist for tyranny, publicly offering his support to Libya's Colonel Gaddafi, Cuba's Castro regime, and to Gaza's ruling Hamas.³⁷ Corbyn has also been a consistent critic of Israel and its successive governments, and a long-term supporter of the

Labour Movement Campaign for Palestine; which adopted a policy of installing a democratic secular state to replace Israel.³⁸

How is it that the political left, so long associated with notions of economic justice, fairness and equality — and also a long-time natural home for many British Jews — could become the conduit for such blatant prejudice and discrimination levelled against Jewish people?

Dave Rich argues that Corbyn is both a leader and a product of a political culture whose deep roots can be traced back to the 19th century when Marxism posed what became known as 'the Jewish Question' — a questioning of the economic and political status of Jews in European society.³⁹ This evolved into the overt antisemitism prosecuted by the Soviet Union in the 20th century; which included purges, anti-Zionist propaganda, and allegations of Jewish disloyalty.

After Corbyn's election as leader, stories about antisemitism and anti-Zionism within the Labour Party started to appear with increasing regularity. Accounts of antisemitic incidents at university Labour clubs emerged, as well as news of suspensions of some party members for alleged antisemitic language.⁴⁰ As a worsening crisis of antisemitism engulfed Labour — and while Jewish support for the Labour Party collapsed — Corbyn appeared reluctant to acknowledge the existence of any problem.

Corbyn did establish an inquiry into antisemitism within the party; which gathered evidence selectively and delivered its report swiftly —clearing the party of systemic wrong-doing.⁴¹ However, the chair of the inquiry, human rights lawyer Sharmishta Chakrabarti, was compromised because she subsequently joined the Labour Party and was nominated by Corbyn to sit as a Labour peer in the House of Lords.

Nor did the problem of antisemitism within Labour's ranks disappear. Indeed, it became more acute in 2019 with the suspension of MP Chris Williamson for remarks he made about antisemitism,⁴² and the resignation of several MPs.

The first of those was Luciana Berger, followed by Louise Ellman, who was reported to have said of Corbyn, "I see no indication at all that he recognizes his responsibility for what is happening, or indeed wants to do anything about it. I see no contrition, no recognition of his role in this terrible situation."⁴³

A non-Jewish Labour MP, John Mann, also resigned in 2019, citing Corbyn's repeated failure to act against antisemitism. Mann, who served until his resignation as Chairman of the All-Party Parliamentary Group on Antisemitism, warned: "[Corbyn] has given a green light to anti-Semites and done nothing to reverse that."⁴⁴ Since leaving the House of Commons, Mann, who was created a life peer in September 2019, has been appointed as Independent Adviser to the UK Government on Antisemitism.

Postmodern left antisemitism has become front-page news because of this blatant manifestation within the British Labour Party. Corbyn, himself, is not responsible for this antisemitism; but his failure to address antisemitism has now brought the party to the point where even its supporters believe the party to be systemically antisemitic. As Labour barrister Adam Wagner has remarked:

When people look back on Labour and Jeremy Corbyn's response to antisemitism, the question is unlikely to be whether the party

became institutionally antisemitic, but when. Taken together, the failures in leadership, processes and culture have created a toxic brew. For a party with a history of being at the vanguard of anti-racism, it hurts.⁴⁵

This is a view supported by Dave Rich, whose seminal work on left-wing antisemitism in Britain has helped identify the problem's depth and complexity. Rich argues that Corbyn's responses to the issue of antisemitism reveal "a pattern of thought and behavior that speaks to a deeper malaise that has been building within the British left for decades. It reflects an antisemitic political culture."⁴⁶

The crisis about antisemitism engulfing British Labour has focused to a large extent on the behaviour of Corbyn himself, and his refusal to either acknowledge or act on the issue; but Labour's problem is that of institutional antisemitism. Not every party member is antisemitic; but the themes of anti-racism, anti-colonialism, anti-capitalism, and anti-Zionism have all combined to provide fertile ground in which antisemitic attitudes within the party have grown and festered.

Yet Corbyn refuses to concede — let alone address — the existence of antisemitism within Labour ranks, because he refuses to accept that opposition to racist colonialism is equivalent, in the case of Israel, to hatred of Jews.⁴⁷

According to the world view to which he is committed, racism is about structural discrimination whereby power is exercised over the marginalised. Since it is axiomatic for these critics that the State of Israel is a racist endeavour, they simply cannot accept that a commitment to anti-racism and defence of the powerless against the claims of the powerful can be antisemitic. In their view, if colonialism is racism, it cannot be antisemitic to condemn colonialism.

Scarcely a week goes by without news emerging of some new convulsion gripping the party.⁴⁸ As Rich has remarked: "this combination of ideological hostility, personal prejudice, and organizational failings has brought Jeremy Corbyn's Labour Party to a state that can be fairly described as institutionally antisemitic."⁴⁹

As Labour's scandal of antisemitism worsens, many UK Jewish leaders now consider the party — long the home of British Jewry — a threat to Jewish life there. According to a September 2018 poll commissioned by the London-based *Jewish Chronicle*, 85.6% of British Jews consider antisemitism to have significantly infiltrated all levels of the Labour Party.⁵⁰

The Squad: Postmodern Left Antisemitism in the United States

The cultural shift in emphasis that has occurred in left-wing politics in the United Kingdom has also taken place in the US. As in Britain, American identity politics is driving a determination to correct perceived imbalances of power expressed in issues of race, gender, and intersectionality.

Among a younger generation of political activists on the American left, these progressive issues have displaced concerns about economic injustice; but they have also ignited postmodern forms of antisemitism.

The confluence of Islam and the politics of identity have been particularly powerful in driving antisemitism on the American political left where contempt for the US has comingled with a rejection of Israel — which is considered one part of the bitter legacy of western imperialism in the Middle East. The enthusiastic support shown for Israel and for Jews by President Donald Trump serves only to fuel the US left's postmodern antisemitism.

Four first-term members of Congress have quickly become the focus of concern about this rise of US postmodern antisemitism. Alexander Ocasio-Cortez, Ilhan Omar, Rashida Tlaib, and Ayanna Pressley were all elected to Congress in the mid-term elections in November 2018. The four Congresswomen have been dubbed "The Squad" — a term coined by Ocasio-Cortez a week after their election.⁵¹

All four — but Omar and Tlaib, in particular — have attracted severe rebukes for repeatedly invoking

antisemitic stereotypes about the claimed dual loyalty of Jews, economic power of Jews, and Israel's colonial intentions.⁵²

Criticism of Israel, in particular, became the focus of a row with the Israeli government in August 2019 when Omar and Tlaib were denied entry to Israel on the basis of their overt support for the BDS campaign. In making its decision to deny them entry, there were reports that the Israeli government came under pressure from President Trump to make its decision.⁵³ However, when Israel subsequently granted permission to Tlaib to visit the country subject to the condition that she did not express any political views, she declined the invitation.⁵⁴

There are growing concerns that by tolerating — and even excusing — the antisemitism expressed by the Squad, the Democratic Party is institutionalising antisemitism in much the same way the Labour Party has done in Britain.⁵⁵ And it is likely that left-wing antisemitism in the US, as in Britain, is only set to worsen. As Victor Davis Hanson has remarked:

Radical Muslims and the Left disguise their hatred of Jews by claiming that they are only championing downtrodden Palestinians. Anti-Semitism is only going to intensify. It is naturally at home on the multicultural Left. The media, popular culture, universities, and left-wing political parties either cannot or will not stop it.⁵⁶

Is there a problem of postmodern left antisemitism in Australia?

For the most part, the Australian Labor Party has so far been spared the travails of either its British counterpart or the US Democrats. However, voices critical of Israel, and suspicious of supposed Jewish influence in finance, politics, and the media, are becoming increasingly prominent on the political left in Australia.

In her 2018 report on antisemitism in Australia for the Executive Council of Australian Jewry, Julie Nathan catalogued numerous remarks and responses made by those on the political left; such as NSW ALP MP Shaoquett Moselmane, former NSW Premier Bob Carr, and NSW Greens MP Tamara Smith.⁵⁷ These remarks tended to focus on support for the Palestinians and criticism of the State of Israel.

Carr's remarks, in particular, have caused considerable dismay in some quarters because of his earlier, public support for Israel and the Jewish community in Australia.⁵⁸ His views had changed by the time he ceased serving as Foreign Minister in the Gillard government, when he became very critical of what he called the "pro-Israel lobby in Melbourne" which had "extremely conservative instincts" and which wielded disproportionate influence over government policy.⁵⁹

But his change of view — and the rise of left wing antisemitism in Australia in general — can be explained by the politics of those Labor-held seats now containing large Muslim populations that are religiously and culturally conservative, but also hostile to Israel and sympathetic to the Palestinian cause.

The ALP's problem is exacerbated because in some of the seats it needs to hold — such as in Western Sydney — there is growing support for the Australian Greens, a party that maintains both an intense hostility towards Israel and the United States, and a very strong commitment to the Palestinians.

Such factors help to explain why Labor has been pulled further away from its historically pro-Zionist position to utter denunciations of not just the Israeli government but the State of Israel itself. Indeed, as this paper has noted, a critical feature of postmodern left antisemitism is the revival of anti-Zionist rhetoric fueled by its antagonism to the existence of Israel: "a prosperous democracy and undeclared nuclear power that is nearing the historic threshold of being home to the majority of the world's Jews."⁶⁰

Similar hostility to Israel is frequently displayed by the Australian Greens, whose stance on Israel and Palestine is marked by the kind of anti-Zionism so characteristic of postmodern left antisemitism. In a tweet posted on 8 June 2018, NSW Greens Senator

Mehreen Faruqi declared: "Thanks everyone for standing in solidarity with the Palestinian people. End the occupation. End the blockade. Free Palestine!"⁶¹ There is every indication that the Greens' anti-Zionism will not lessen, but intensify.⁶²

Indeed, there are few signs that left-wing positions on Israel, Zionism, and antisemitism are likely to change quickly — either in Australia or the UK. As Mendes has noted: "Left groups do not view Jews as a vulnerable or oppressed group, and do not prioritize the struggle against anti-Semitism."⁶³

At the same time, nor are Jews as vulnerable as they once were to the oppression from right-wing regimes that served to rally the support of the left.

Yet a vital opportunity now presents itself to the ALP, the Australian Greens, and other domestic left-wing groups, to ensure that the long-standing commitment of the Australian left to the pursuit of justice and human decency is freed from the ugly taint of antisemitism.

Endnotes

- 1 While recording the extensive political and religious conflict in which Jewish communities were caught up in the ancient world, Edward Flannery identifies Egypt in the 3rd century BCE as the place where "the first clear traces of a specifically anti-Jewish sentiment appears." Edward Flannery, *The Anguish of the Jews: Twenty-Three Centuries of Antisemitism*, (Mahwah, New Jersey: Paulist Press, 1999), 11.
- 2 Daniel Jonah Goldhagen, *The Devil that Never Dies: The Rise and Threat of Global Antisemitism*, (New York: Little, Brown & Co., 2013), 81.
- 3 Jonathan Sacks, quoted in Bernard Harrison, *The Resurgence of Anti-Semitism: Jews, Israel, and Liberal Opinion*, (Lanham, Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield, 2006), 20.
- 4 International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance, *Working Definition of Antisemitism*, (26 May 2016) <https://www.holocaustremembrance.com/node/196>
- 5 Marc Thiessen, "The rise of anti-Semitism on the Left", *Philadelphia Inquirer*, (13 August 2019) <https://www.inquirer.com/opinion/commentary/anti-semitism-left-liberals-marc-thiessen-20190814.html>
- 6 *Israel's Religiously Divided Society*, Pew Research Center (March 2016), 222-223 <https://www.pewforum.org/2016/03/08/anti-semitism-and-discrimination>
- 7 Daniel Jonah Goldhagen, as above, 175.
- 8 See Deborah Lipstadt, as above, 19.
- 9 Robert Wistrich, "The Changing Face of Anti-Semitism", *Commentary*, March 2013, Vol. 135 (3), 31-34, 33.
- 10 *Combatting Antisemitism to Eliminate Discrimination and Intolerance Based on Religion or Belief*, United Nations Special Rapporteur on Freedom of Religion and Belief (20 September 2019), https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Issues/Religion/A_74_47921ADV.pdf
- 11 *Combatting Antisemitism*, as above, para. 17.
- 12 See Melanie Phillips, <https://www.facebook.com/watch/?v=250284799188055>
- 13 See Philip Mendes, "Whatever happened to the political alliance of the Jews and the Left?", *ABC Religion & Ethics* (20 June 2018) <https://www.abc.net.au/religion/whatever-happened-to-the-political-alliance-of-the-jews-and-the-/10094614>
- 14 See Ruth R. Wisse, "The Functions of Anti-Semitism", *National Affairs* (Number 41, Fall 2019) <https://nationalaffairs.com/publications/detail/the-functions-of-anti-semitism>
- 15 David Cesarani, "Anti-Zionism in Britain, 1922-2002: Continuities and Discontinuities", *The Journal of Israeli History*, Vol. 25, No. 1, (March 2006), 131-160, 146.
- 16 Philip Mendes, "When does criticism of Zionism and Israel become anti-Jewish racial hatred?", in Peter Kurti (ed.), *What's New with Anti-Semitism?*, (Centre for Independent Studies: St Leonards, NSW, 2012), 15.
- 17 United Nations General Assembly Resolution 3379 was passed on 10 November 1975 by a vote of 72 to 35, with 32 abstentions. It was revoked on 16 December 1991 by UN General Assembly Resolution 46/86 by a vote of 111 to 25, with 13 abstentions.
- 18 Dave Rich, *The Left's Jewish Problem: Jeremy Corbyn, Israel and Antisemitism*, (Biteback Publishing: London, 2018), 112.
- 19 Dave Rich, *The Left's Jewish Problem*, as above, 343.
- 20 Robert Wistrich, as above, 32.
- 21 Daniel Jonah Goldhagen, as above, 250.
- 22 Daniel Jonah Goldhagen, as above, 246.
- 23 Daniel Jonah Goldhagen, as above, 250, 388.
- 24 Ben Cohen, "A Discourse of delegitimation: The British Left and the Jews", originally written for the Institute of Jewish Policy Research, London, 2003 and available at www.axt.org.uk/HateMusic/essay_cohen_delegitimation.htm p.3
- 25 Ben Cohen, as above, 3.
- 26 Daniel Jonah Goldhagen, as above, 399
- 27 The National Council of Churches in Australia, founded in 1994, is an ecumenical organization bringing together some 19 member churches for the purposes of dialogue, practical cooperation, and political lobbying. In its time, the Executive Body of the NCCA has issued social justice policy statements on issues such as gambling, poverty, housing and racism.
- 28 <http://www.ncca.org.au/home/media-releases/550-a-call-for-justice-security-and-peace-for-palestine-and-israel>
- 29 See "What is BDS?" *BDS Freedom Justice Equality* <https://bdsmovement.net/what-is-bds>
- 30 <http://www.bdsmovement.net/bdsintro#.TqTYgXEcVQo>
- 31 Sonja Karkar, *Boycott, Divestment, Sanctions – A Global Campaign to End Israeli Apartheid*, (Melbourne: Australians for Palestine, 2011), 39.
- 32 Jeremy Jones, *Anti-Semitism in Australia 2010*, (Sydney: ECAJ, 2010), p.6. The report is prepared annually on behalf of the Executive Council of Australian Jewry to assist in the understanding of anti-Jewish prejudice in contemporary Australia.
- 33 Jeremy Jones, as above, 9.
- 34 Julie Nathan, *Report on Antisemitism in Australia 2018*, (Sydney: ECAJ, 2018), 7.

- 35 Julie Nathan, "The resurgence of racism in the 2019 federal election – a deep and disturbing trend", *ABC Religion & Ethics*, (31 May 2019) <https://www.abc.net.au/religion/the-resurgence-of-racism-and-antisemitism-in-the-2019-federal-e/11167332>.
- 36 Sophie Deutsch, "Leeser: 'Dirtiest, nastiest election I can remember'", *Australian Jewish News*, (30 May 2019). <https://ajn.timesofisrael.com/leeser-dirtiest-nastiest-election-i-can-remember/>
- 37 Robin Simcox, "Jeremy Corbyn has a soft spot for extremists", *Foreign Policy*, (3 October 2018) <https://foreignpolicy.com/2018/10/03/jeremy-corbyn-has-a-soft-spot-for-extremists-ira-hamas-hezbollah-britain-labour/>
- 38 David Abulafia, "In Corbyn's mind, there is no place for the Jews", *Standpoint*, (October 2018), 20-25.
- 39 Dave Rich, "The Etiology of Antisemitism in Corbyn's Labour Party", *Israel Journal of Foreign Affairs*, (2018 Vol.12, No.3), 357-365, 358.
- 40 See, for example, Aftab Ali, "Oxford University Labour Club students did engage in anti-Semitic behaviour, report finds", *The Independent*, (3 August 2016) <https://www.independent.co.uk/student/news/oxford-university-labour-club-anti-semitism-report-baroness-royall-jewish-students-a7170446.html>
- 41 "Chakrabarti inquiry: Labour not overrun by anti-Semitism", *BBC News*, (30 June 2016) <https://www.bbc.com/news/uk-politics-36672022>
- 42 See, for example, Peter Mason, "The resignation of Luciana Berger is a watershed moment for many Jewish Labour members", *New Statesman*, (20 February 2019); and "MP Chris Williamson loses anti-Semitism suspension appeal", *BBC News*, (10 October 2019) <https://www.bbc.com/news/uk-england-derbyshire-50002636>
- 43 Henry Zeffman, "MP Louise Ellman quits Labour and says Corbyn is a danger to Britain", *The Times*, (16 October 2019) <https://www.thetimes.co.uk/article/mp-louise-ellman-quits-labour-and-says-corbyn-is-a-danger-to-britain-j80htb5fv>
- 44 Naomi Levin, "Mann's mission to fight antisemitism", *Australia/Jewish Affairs Council*, (3 October 2019) <https://aijac.org.au/featured/manns-mission-to-fight-antisemitism/>
- 45 Adam Wagner, "Labour's antisemitism problem is institutional. It needs investigation", *The Guardian*, (8 March 2019) <https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2019/mar/07/labour-antisemitism-investigation>
- 46 Dave Rich, "The Etiology of Antisemitism in Corbyn's Labour Party", *Israel Journal of Foreign Affairs*, Vol. 12, No. 3, (2018), 357-365, 359.
- 47 See Daniel Johnson, "Corbyn waves the flag of anti-Semitism", *Standpoint*, (December 2018-January 2019), 64-67.
- 48 See, for example, Harry Cole, "Jeremy Corbyn in fresh anti-Semitism row after defending controversial hard-Left candidate who described Israel as 'a pig'", *Daily Mail*, (27 October 2019), <https://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-7617909/Jeremy-Corbyn-fresh-anti-Semitism-storm-defending-controversial-hard-Left-Labour-candidate.html>
- 49 Dave Rich, "The Etiology of Antisemitism in Corbyn's Labour Party", as above, 364.
- 50 Daniel Sugarman, "More than 85 per cent of British Jews think Jeremy Corbyn is antisemitic", *Jewish Chronicle*, (13 September 2018) <https://www.thejc.com/news/uk-news/more-than-85-per-cent-of-british-jews-think-jeremy-corbyn-is-antisemitic-1.469654>
- 51 See "The Squad (United States Congress)", *Wikipedia*, [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/The_Squad_\(United_States_Congress\)](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/The_Squad_(United_States_Congress))
- 52 See, for example, Ayaan Hirsi Ali, "Can Ilhan Omar overcome her prejudice?", *Wall Street Journal*, (12 July 2019) <https://www.wsj.com/articles/can-ilhan-omar-overcome-her-prejudice-11562970265>
- 53 "Benjamin Netanyahu bans Ilhan Omar and Rashida Tlaib from Israel after pressure from Donald Trump", *ABC News* (16 August 2019) <https://www.abc.net.au/news/2019-08-16/israel-bans-ilhan-omar-and-rashida-tlaib-under-pressure-trump/11420450>
- 54 Oliver Holmes, "Rashida Tlaib rejects Israel's offer for 'humanitarian' visit to West Bank", *The Guardian*, (16 August 2019) <https://www.theguardian.com/us-news/2019/aug/16/israel-to-allow-entry-to-rashida-tlaib-for-humanitarian-visit>
- 55 See, for example, Abraham Miller, "Institutionalizing Anti-Semitism in the Halls of Congress", *The American Spectator*, (7 March 2019) <https://spectator.org/institutionalizing-anti-semitism-in-the-halls-of-congress/>
- 56 Victor Davis Hanson, "Why Progressive Anti-Semitism – and Why Now?", *National Review*, (7 May 2019) <https://www.nationalreview.com/2019/05/progressive-anti-semitism-multicultural-left-new-york-times/>
- 57 See Julie Nathan, *Report on Antisemitism in Australia 2018*, (Sydney: ECAJ, 2018), 83-100.
- 58 Nick Dyrenfurth, "British Labour, anti-Semitism and the immorality of Jeremy Corbyn", *ABC Religion & Ethics*, (28 February 2019) <https://www.abc.net.au/religion/labour-anti-semitism-and-the-immorality-of-jeremy-corbyn/10857676>
- 59 "Former foreign minister Bob Carr says 'pro-Israel lobby' influenced government policy", *ABC News*, (10 April 2014) <https://www.abc.net.au/news/2014-04-09/bob-carr-lashes-out-at-melbourne-pro-israel-lobby/5379074>

- 60 Yaroslav Trofimov, "The New Anti-Semitism", *Wall Street Journal*, (12 July 2019) <https://www.wsj.com/articles/the-new-anti-semitism-11562944476>
- 61 <https://twitter.com/MehreenFaruqi/status/1005288784869523456>
- 62 Naomi Levin, "Greens problems with Israel and Jews worsen", *Australia/Israel & Jewish Affairs Council*, (29 April 2019) <https://aijac.org.au/australia-israel-review/greens-problems-with-israel-and-jews-worsen/>
- 63 Philip Mendes, "Whatever happened to the political alliance of the Jews and the Left?", *ABC Religion & Ethics*, (20 June 2018) <https://www.abc.net.au/religion/whatever-happened-to-the-political-alliance-of-the-jews-and-the-/10094614>

About the Author



Peter Kurti

Peter Kurti is a Senior Research Fellow and Director of the Culture Prosperity & Civil Society program at the Centre for Independent Studies. He is also Adjunct Associate Professor of Law at the University of Notre Dame Australia.

Related works

Peter Kurti, *The Tyranny of Tolerance: Threats to Religious Liberty in Australia* (2017)

Paul Kelly, Philip Mendes, Peter Kurti, *What's New with Antisemitism?* (2012)

THE CENTRE FOR
INDEPENDENT
STUDIES

POLICY Paper 25 (PP25) • ISSN: 2209-2447 • ISBN: 978-1-925744-50-7

Published November 2019 by the Centre for Independent Studies Limited. Views expressed are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Centre's staff, advisors, directors or officers.

© the Centre for Independent Studies (ABN 15 001 495 012)

This publication is available from the Centre for Independent Studies. Visit www.cis.org.au.